

MINUTES of the Planning Commission Meeting of the City of Redlands held Tuesday, November 25, 2003, at 2:00 p.m. are as follows:

PRESENT: George Webber, Chair
James Macdonald, Vice-Chairman
Ruth Cook, Commissioner
Caroline Laymon, Commissioner
Gary Miller, Commissioner
Thomas Osborne, Commissioner

ABSENT: Paul Thompson, Commissioner

ADVISORY STAFF

PRESENT: Jeffrey L. Shaw, Director
John Jaquess, City Planner
Leslie E. Murad II, Assistant City Attorney
Robert Dalquest, Principal Planner/Project Manager
Asher Hartel, Senior Planner
Richard Malacoff, Associate Planner
Manuel Baeza, Associate Planner
Alicia Heideman, Junior Planner

I. CALL TO ORDER AND PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD

Chairman Webber called the meeting to order at 2:04 p.m. All Commissioners were present except Commissioner Thompson.

II. CONSENT ITEMS - NONE

III. OLD BUSINESS

- A. **CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT NO. 797** - Public Hearing for the Planning Commission to consider a Mitigated Negative Declaration and a Conditional Use Permit to construct a religious institution consisting of a 20,300 square foot worship center and a 13,278 square foot sanctuary on 4.62 acres located on the southwest corner of Lugonia Avenue and Texas Street in the R-1, Single Family Residential District. Request submitted by the Second Baptist Church of Redlands.

Mr. John Jaquess advised the Commission that the representative for Second Baptist Church was delayed due to heavy traffic. The proposed project was tabled to the end of the meeting.

- B. **VARIANCE NO. 648** - PUBLIC HEARING for the Planning Commission to consider Variance requests from Municipal Code Section 18.52.130.A, to allow a reduction in the required setback along Grove Street from twenty-five feet (25') to fourteen feet (14') and a request for a variance from Municipal Code Section 18.140.360 requiring not less than 3,000 square feet of open space recreation area or 400 square feet for each mobile home space within an existing mobile home park located at 1251 E. Lugonia Avenue within the R-2 Multi-Family Residential Zone. Request submitted by Tuttle Engineering.
- C. **CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT NO. 172 (Revision No. 1)** PUBLIC HEARING for the Planning Commission to consider a Conditional Use Permit to create 18 additional mobile home spaces on approximately 3.43 acres of vacant land on property to the east of an existing mobile home park, located at 1251 E. Lugonia Avenue within the R-2 Multi-Family Residential Zone. Request submitted by Tuttle Engineering.

Mr. Jaquess stated that staff has been working with the applicant to address concerns raised by the Planning Commission. Mr. Jaquess stated the project is being redesigned, therefore staff is recommending the proposed project be continued to December 9th.

Chairman Webber opened the public hearing. Seeing no comments forthcoming, Chairman Webber closed the public hearing.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Osborne, seconded by Commissioner Macdonald, and carried on a 6-0 vote that the Planning Commission continue Variance No. 648 and Conditional Use Permit No. 172 (Revision 1) to December 9, 2003.

IV. NEW BUSINESS

- A. **SPECIFIC PLAN NO. 58** - PUBLIC HEARING for the Planning Commission to consider a recommendation to the City Council on a Mitigated Negative Declaration and a Specific Plan to develop 5.01 gross acres into a seventy-two (72) unit condominium development located at the southwest corner of Orange Avenue and Kansas Street. Request submitted by ABCO REALTY AND INVESTMENTS.
- B. **TENTATIVE TRACT NO. 16548** - PUBLIC HEARING for the Planning Commission to consider a recommendation to the City Council on a Mitigated Negative Declaration, Socio-Economic Cost/Benefit Study, and a Tentative Tract Map to subdivide 5.01 gross acres into a seventy-two (72) unit condominium development in the 2500 RM Multiple Family Residential District of the East Valley Corridor Specific Plan (proposed Specific Plan No. 58) located at the southwest corner of Orange Avenue and Kansas Street. Request submitted by ABCO REALTY AND INVESTMENTS.

Mr. Jaquess stated the applicant submitted revised plans based upon comments received at a prior Planning Commission meeting and as the result of a workshop held on the project. Mr. Jaquess stated that staff has not had adequate time to prepare the staff report for a final recommendation to the Commission. Mr. Jaquess requested the proposed project be continued to December 9th.

Chairman Webber asked Mr. Jaquess for information on condominium projects in the City that have been approved. Mr. Jaquess stated staff would provide the information.

Chairman Webber opened the public hearing. Seeing no comments forthcoming, Chairman Webber closed the public hearing.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Macdonald, seconded by Commissioner Cook, and carried on a 6-0 vote that the Planning Commission continue Specific Plan No. 58 and Tentative Tract Map No. 16548 to December 9th.

- C. **VARIANCE NO. 664** - PUBLIC HEARING for Planning Commission consideration of a Variance from Section 18.40.120 of the Redlands Municipal Code to reduce the requirement for a front-yard setback for a residential building from twenty-five (25) feet to fourteen feet-four inches (14'4") on the Dreka Avenue frontage and a variance from Section 18.44.150 to reduce the requirement for the rear yard setback from twenty-five (25) feet to twenty (20) feet for the property located on the southeast corner of Dreka Avenue and Clay Street in the R-1, Residential District. Request submitted by HABITAT FOR HUMANITY.

Ms. Alicia Heideman gave a brief PowerPoint presentation on the proposed project.

Commissioner Miller asked if fencing is being proposed for the back yard.

Ms. Heideman stated she spoke with the applicant and advised them that a minor exception permit could be processed concurrently with the variance application, but the applicant chose not to install fencing at this time.

Commissioner Miller asked Ms. Heideman if there was any discussion on keeping the house closer to the setback of the other homes on Clay Street and possibly fencing in the backyard area located by the garage.

Ms. Heideman stated that staff suggested detaching the garage, which would place the house twenty-five (25) feet from Clay Street and the garage five (5) feet from the rear property line. Ms. Heideman continued by stating that the applicant could use an automatic garage door opener and fence off the area between the garage and house. However, there is a door that provides access from the garage to a utility room in the house, therefore the applicant preferred to keep the garage attached.

Chairman Webber opened the public hearing.

Ms. Sue Pope, Habitat for Humanity, stated the homeowner is a single mother with three small children who would like to be able to pull into an attached garage and unload her vehicle rather than having to leave the children unattended. Ms. Pope stated the owner felt that standard fencing would be adequate and she noted that the homeowner's father will install wrought iron fencing in the yard area.

Chairman Webber closed the public hearing.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Macdonald, seconded by Commissioner Miller, and carried on a 6-0 vote that the Planning Commission approve Variance No. 664 subject to the following findings:

1. There are exceptional or extraordinary circumstances or conditions such as the existing substandard lot size that are applicable to the property that prevents the applicant from complying with the required twenty-five (25) foot front and rear yard setbacks.
2. That the variance is necessary for the preservation and enjoyment of a substantial property right possessed by other properties in the same vicinity and zone district, but which is denied to the property in question.
3. That the granting of the variance will not be detrimental to the public welfare or injurious to the property or improvements of others in the vicinity.
4. That the granting of the variance will not adversely affect the General Plan of the City of Redlands.

Mr. Shaw distributed a letter received from Mr. David Waters who requested an opportunity to speak before the Commission. Mr. Shaw noted that Mr. Waters wanted to speak on another project developed by Centex Homes, and not the project listed on the agenda.

- D. **RDA 2003-IV-01** - A recommendation to the City Council for the approval of points for a Residential Development Allocation request for Tentative Tract No. 16174, an approved residential subdivision consisting of 68 lots on 30 acres generally located on the north side of Pioneer Avenue approximately 440 feet east of Occidental Drive. (Note: This request is for 36 allocations; a total of 32 allocations were previously awarded in the second and third quarters of 2003.) Request submitted by CENTEX HOMES.

Chairman Webber opened the public hearing, stating that he wanted to hear from speakers in the audience before reviewing the residential development allocations.

Mr. Waters stated his letter addresses the Centex project that is located on Wabash.

Chairman Webber closed the public hearing.

Chairman Webber asked how many residential development allocations remain to be awarded. Mr. Jaquess stated 50 residential development allocations can be awarded for the fourth quarter.

Commissioner Cook asked for information on the grading for Lots 1 and 2, stating that the residents who buy the homes will walk out onto their backyards and find that they are level with the top of a block wall.

Mr. Jaquess stated the grading and landscaping plans for the project have been approved and they are unable to modify the plans at this time.

Chairman Webber opened the public hearing.

Mr. Pat Meyer, representing the applicant, stated the City requires all lots to drain to the street, which required the grading for this project to be kicked up to allow the lot to drain properly.

Commissioner Macdonald asked Mr. Meyer if the Centex development uses stucco over foam. Mr. Meyer stated he did not think so; he believed wood 2 by 4's are used.

Commissioner Macdonald asked Mr. Meyer if vinyl windows were used for the Centex development. Mr. Meyer stated he was not sure; but he believed that vinyl windows seal off the homes which can cause mold problems.

Commissioner Macdonald asked Mr. Meyer if the Centex development uses fiberglass front doors. Mr. Meyer stated he was not sure.

Commissioner Miller stated that use of stucco over foam trim is very common, as it is inexpensive. Commissioner Miller stated there are both good and bad quality aluminum windows and vinyl windows.

Chairman Webber closed the public hearing.

Mr. Hartel reviewed the project point allocations with the Commission. The Planning Commission awarded 32 points to Centex Homes for a total of 95 points.

- E. **RDA 2003-IV-02** - A recommendation to the City Council for the approval of points for a Residential Development Allocation request for Tentative Tract No. 16139, an approved residential subdivision consisting of 19 lots on 7.2 acres generally located on the north side of Cypress Avenue, east of Heather Lane and west of Linda Vista avenue. (Note: This request is for 19 allocations; none have been previously awarded.) Request submitted by MEADOW WOOD HOMES, LLC.

Mr. Hartel stated that the Meadowood Homes project recently went through the RDA process but received insufficient points for an award of allocations. Mr. Hartel stated the applicant revised his allocation request to increase landscaping and enhance the elevations of the project.

Chairman Webber opened the public hearing.

Mr. Joe O'Brien, applicant, stated that there are two projects before the Commission requesting Residential Development Allocations; Centex Homes which is requesting an allocation for 36 homes and his project which is requesting an allocation for 19 homes. Mr. O'Brien stated if he does not receive a total allocation for 19 homes, he will not be able to proceed with the project, as it cannot be built in phases. Mr. O'Brien requested additional points and stated that he felt his project was superior to the Centex Homes in architecture. Mr. O'Brien noted that each home in his project has a different orientation which protects the views for the homeowners. Mr. O'Brien stated that he has added 2,300 shrubs to the landscaping for his project. Mr. O'Brien stated he felt he should receive additional points for architecture, grading, and view protection.

Mr. Dusty Shenski, Project Superintendent, stated he uses a high density foam on areas over four (4) feet high; however, on entryways wood is used on any surface that is under four (4) foot high. Mr. Shenski stated that fiberglass doors are used because the cost for an eight (8) foot oak door would run approximately \$10,000. Mr. Shenski stated he uses upgraded vinyl windows on the project.

Commissioner Macdonald asked for information on the price range of the homes.

Mr. O'Brien stated the homes would sell for \$390k to \$580k and would range in size from 2,700 to 4,000 square feet.

Chairman Webber stated that he and Commissioner Macdonald walked through the residential development Mr. O'Brien built off of Olive Street and they were approached by two ladies who were not happy with problems experienced by homeowners in that development.

Mr. O'Brien stated that the homeowners have a one year warranty period. Commissioner Macdonald said that the homeowners stated the subcontractors would not come out to repair items that were covered under the warranty.

Commissioner Macdonald asked Mr. O'Brien if he replaced an air conditioning unit that failed on one of the homes. Mr. O'Brien stated that he did and he finished off some rough stucco on the home.

Mr. O'Brien stated that most of the homeowners were happy with the development and he identified specific issues on various lots within the development.

Chairman Webber stated that the staff report noted that several trees had been removed from the site. Chairman Webber asked Mr. O'Brien how many oak trees had been removed. Mr. O'Brien stated that an oak tree that was located between Lots 1 and 2 was removed, but it has been preserved and will be replanted on site, however an oak tree on Lot 14 was removed.

Mr. Hartel reviewed the project point allocations with the Commission. The Planning Commission awarded Meadowood Homes 38 points for a total of 95 points.

Mr. Shaw stated since both projects received the same number of points, staff would recommend that Meadowood Homes receive 19 allocations and the remainder would go to Centex Homes.

Item IIIA which was tabled earlier in the meeting was heard at this time.

CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT NO. 797 - Public Hearing for the Planning Commission to consider a Mitigated Negative Declaration and a Conditional Use Permit to construct a religious institution consisting of a 20,300 square foot worship center and a 13,278 square foot sanctuary on 4.62 acres located on the southwest corner of Lugonia Avenue and Texas Street in the R-1, Single Family Residential District. Request submitted by the Second Baptist Church of Redlands.

Mr. Malacoff stated the applicant modified the site plan to meet landscape, site, and architectural issues that were requested by staff. Mr. Malacoff stated that staff was recommending additional conditions of approval.

Chairman Webber opened the public hearing.

Mr. Robert Terrell, representing Second Baptist Church, stated he was unclear on the five (5) foot dimension for parking but he adjusted the parking and would make the parking "fingers" six (6) feet where they need to be. Mr. Terrell stated he could modify the trees per staff's request.

Chairman Webber closed the public hearing.

Chairman Webber stated he supports Mr. Malacoff's recommendation to replace the Austrian willow and the glossy privet, and he would like the California Bay tree to be replaced. Chairman Webber stated that he would like the landscape plan to come back to the Commission for final approval.

Commissioner Osborne suggested the landscape plan be approved by the Community Development Director and one Planning Commissioner. Mr. Malacoff stated that he would draft an additional conditional of approval to reflect this change.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Miller, seconded by Commissioner Osborne, and carried on a 6-0 vote that the Planning Commission approve the Mitigated Negative Declaration for Conditional Use Permit No. 797 and direct staff to file and post a "Notice of Determination" in accordance with City guidelines. It has been determined this project will not individually or cumulatively affect wildlife resources as defined in Section 711.2 of the California Fish and Game Code.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Miller, seconded by Commissioner Osborne, and carried on a 6-0 vote that the Planning Commission approve Conditional Use Permit No. 797 based on the following findings:

1. The religious institution applied for at the southwest corner of Lugonia Avenue and Texas Street is proper for a Conditional Use Permit;
2. The religious institution as proposed is a project that is necessary, essential, and desirable for the public welfare as well as the development of the community;
3. The religious institution is not detrimental to existing or permitted uses in the R-1, Single Family Residential District where this use is to be located;
4. The size and shape of the site are adequate for the proposed religious institution.
5. The site properly relates to Lugonia Avenue and Texas Street to carry the type and quantity of traffic to be generated by the proposed religious institution;
6. The conditions set forth on this Conditional Use Permit are deemed necessary and reasonable to protect the public health, safety and general welfare; the best interests of the neighborhood;
7. The proposed project will be consistent with the existing Medium-Density Residential Land Use District of the General Plan; and the following revisions,

Condition of Approval 12 to read:

The landscape plans shall be approved by the Community Development Director and **one Planning Commissioner** prior to the issuance of grading and or Building permit and shall include the following:

- e. All trees on the site **and parking area** plan shall comply with the following:
 - (2) The *Geijera parviflora* and *Ligustrum lucidum*, and **Umbellularia California (California Bay tree)** shall be replaced by trees that are on the *Planning Commissioner's List of Recommended Shade Trees*,

and the addition of Condition of Approval 31 to read:

31. **All perimeter planter areas shall be corrected to reflect a width of six (6) feet and shall comply with the Code Requirements of Section 18.168.21 (A) (4).**

V. ADDENDA

VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. November 12, 2003

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Osborne, seconded by Commissioner Cook, and carried on a 4-0 vote (Commissioners Laymon and Miller abstaining) that the Planning Commission approve the minutes of the November 12th Planning Commission meeting with a correction noted.

VII. CORRESPONDENCE/COMMUNICATIONS

A. City Council Report

Mr. Shaw gave a brief presentation on the City Council actions of November 18th. Mr. Shaw stated that City Council received the annual report of the General Plan and recommended it be forwarded to the state. Mr. Shaw stated he would make a copy of the report for the Commission.

Chairman Webber opened the public hearing for general comments.

Mr. David Waters congratulated the Commission on its patience while evaluating residential allocation points. Mr. Waters expressed concern relative to the Centex development on Wabash and Fifth Street. Mr. Waters stated he was disappointed with quantity of the earth that has been moved onto the property, specifically Lots 58, 59, and 60.

Mr. Waters continued by saying the Planning Commission required the developer to leave 2-3 rows of the original trees along the Wabash Street frontage to retain the citrus image and help screen the new homes from Wabash. Mr. Waters stated he did not receive notification that the developer requested to be allowed to remove one of the rows of the existing trees. Mr. Waters stated if the Planning Commission cannot rectify the problem, he would have to pursue another avenue to protect his interests.

Assistant City Attorney Les Murad stated that this subject was not agendaized and he suggested that staff add this item to a future agenda so that it may be reviewed by the Commission.

Chairman Webber asked staff to return to the Commission and report if the project is being built per the conditions of approval. Mr. Shaw stated that staff would come back to the Commission with a report.

Chairman Webber closed the public hearing.

VIII. ADJOURNMENT TO DECEMBER 9, 2003

Chairman Webber adjourned the meeting to December 9th at 4:34 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Patricia Ortiz, Senior Admin. Assistant
Community Development Department

Jeffrey L. Shaw, Director
Community Development Department