

MINUTES: of the Planning Commission Meeting of the City of Redlands held Tuesday, February 12, 2008, at 2:00 p.m. are as follows:

PRESENT: Jim Macdonald, Chairman
Paul Foster, Vice Chairman
Gary Miller, Commissioner
Ruth Cook, Commissioner
Carol Dyer, Commissioner
Eric Shamp, Commissioner
John James, Commissioner

ADVISORY STAFF

PRESENT: Robert Dalquest, Assistant Director
Michael Reiter, Assistant City Attorney
Manuel Baeza, Principal Planner
Tabitha Kevari, Assistant Planner
Chris Boatman, Junior Planner

I. CALL TO ORDER AND PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD - 3 MINUTES

Chairman Macdonald called the meeting to order. All Commissioners were present with the exception of Commissioner's Miller and Shamp.

II. CONSENT CALENDAR

A. **ORANGE TREE LANE, LP, APPLICANT**
(PROJECT PLANNER: TERESA PAULSON)

1. A Request for Final Map Approval of **PARCEL MAP NO. 17825 (MINOR SUBDIVISION NO. 302)**, a subdivision of 1.66 acres into one lot for a medical office condominium project located at the southeast corner of Orange Tree Lane and Nevada Street within the Urban Services Commercial District of Specific Plan 25.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner James, seconded by Commissioner Foster and carried on a 5-0 vote to approve the Consent Calendar.

III. OLD BUSINESS

A. **UNIVERSITY OF REDLANDS, APPLICANT**
(PROJECT PLANNER: MANUEL BAEZA)

1. Planning Commission to consider a Mitigated Negative Declaration.
2. **PUBLIC HEARING for CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT NO. 922** – A Conditional Use Permit to develop a new Center for the Arts and addition to the Glen Wallichs Theater with a cumulative area of 54,948 square feet to be located at the southeast corner of Sylvan Boulevard and University Street on the campus of the University of Redlands in the E, Educational District.

Chairman Macdonald opened the public hearing.

Project Planner Manuel Baeza indicated that the project was continued from the January 22, 2008 meeting due to concerns regarding landscaping, architecture and undergrounding of utilities. Mr. Baeza gave an overview of the proposed alternatives relative to undergrounding the utilities, provided colored

elevations for the Commissions review and addressed landscaping concerns. Staff recommended approval of the project subject to the conditions of approval.

Commissioner Miller arrived at 2:05 p.m.

Philip Doolittle, University of Redlands Executive Vice President, stated that undergrounding the utilities would be an unnecessary expense and would not add a lot of value to the project or the City. Mr. Doolittle expressed his concerns that the undergrounding requirement would delay the project. Mr. Doolittle indicated that he was available for questions.

Commissioner James indicated that he was between option numbers two (2) and four (4) and asked what the cost would be to underground poles 2A, 2B and 3. Mr. Doolittle stated that he did not know the cost to underground the three poles.

Commissioner Dyer supported Commissioner James position relative to selecting option numbers two or four.

Commissioner Miller stated that he was inclined to select option number two since it would be measured improvement to the project.

Chairman Macdonald stated that he did not see where the poles were intrusive and recommended not to underground the utilities.

Commissioner James recommended not to underground the utilities and suggested that the University of Redlands spend the funds on future improvements to Park Avenue through Cook Street.

Commissioner Foster indicated that he did not like to see losing opportunities to underground utilities and supported option number two.

Commissioner's Cook and Dyer supported option number four.

Chairman Macdonald indicated that it was the opinion of the Commission to waive the requirement for undergrounding the utility poles.

Assistant Director Dalquest stated that Municipal Utilities and Engineering conditions of approval numbers seven (7) and twenty (20) would be deleted.

Chairman Macdonald closed the public hearing.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner James, seconded by Commissioner Cook, and carried on a 4-2 vote, (Commissioner's Miller and Foster opposed), that the Planning Commission approve the Mitigated Negative Declaration for Conditional Use Permit No. 922 and direct staff to file and post a "Notice of Determination" in accordance with City guidelines.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner James, seconded by Commissioner Cook and carried on a 4-2 vote, (Commissioner's Miller and Foster opposed), that the Planning Commission approve Conditional Use Permit No. 922 based on the following findings:

1. That the proposed development will not adversely affect the applicable land use plans of the City; the project is consistent with existing development found at the University of Redlands;

2. That the proposed development will not be detrimental to the public health, safety and welfare; the project includes Mitigation Measures designed to address concerns of public health and safety;
3. That the proposed development will comply to the maximum extent feasible with the regulations of the City's General Plan, and the E, Educational District;
4. That the proposed Cultural Arts facility is appropriate at the University of Redlands.

This includes the deletion of Municipal Utilities and Engineering conditions of approval number seven (7) and twenty (20).

Commissioner Shamp arrived to the meeting at 2:25 p.m.

B. GREENWICH ENTERPRISES, INC., APPLICANT
(PROJECT PLANNER: MANUEL BAEZA)

1. Planning Commission to consider a Mitigated Negative Declaration.
2. **PUBLIC HEARING** for the Planning Commission to consider a Socio-Economic Cost/Benefit Study.
3. **PUBLIC HEARING** for the Planning Commission to consider **Tentative Tract Map No. 17128** - a Tentative Tract Map to subdivide 2.66 acres into eight (8) residential lots and one (1) common area lot on property located on the west side of Ford Street, generally south of Farview Lane and north of Crestview Road in the R-S, Suburban Residential District.

Chairman Macdonald opened the public hearing.

Project Planner Manuel Baeza indicated that the project was continued from the January 22, 2008 meeting due to concerns regarding aesthetics and lot configuration. Mr. Baeza indicated that the applicant addressed the concerns of the Commission but that staff needs additional time to evaluate the information. Staff recommended continuing the project to the February 26, 2008 meeting.

Chairman Macdonald closed the public hearing.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Miller, seconded by Commissioner James, and carried on a 7-0 vote that the Planning Commission continue the Mitigated Negative Declaration and Public Hearings for the Socio-Economic Cost/Benefit and Tentative Tract No. 17128 to February 26, 2008.

C. REDLANDS CENTER LLC, APPLICANT
(PROJECT PLANNER: MANUEL BAEZA)

1. Planning Commission to consider a Mitigated Negative Declaration.
2. **PUBLIC HEARING** for the Planning Commission to consider a Socio-Economic Cost/Benefit Study.
3. Consideration of **COMMISSION REVIEW AND APPROVAL NO. 838** to develop a commercial retail center consisting of an in-line set of retail businesses and one free standing restaurant with a combined floor area of 51,101 square feet on approximately 4.8 acres, located south of Interstate 10 Freeway on the west

side of California Street in the EV/CG, General Commercial District of the East Valley Corridor Specific Plan.

4. **PUBLIC HEARING** for the Planning Commission to consider **CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT NO. 893** to establish a 2,330 square foot drive-thru food establishment within a proposed retail center located south of Interstate 10 Freeway on the west side of California Street in the EV/CG, General Commercial District of the East Valley Corridor Specific Plan.

Chairman Macdonald opened the public hearing.

Project Planner Manuel Baeza indicated that the applicant has completed revisions to their plans but that the color renderings and details on the railing and light fixtures were not submitted. Staff recommended continuance of the project to the February 26, 2008 meeting.

Chairman Macdonald closed the public hearing.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Dyer, seconded by Commissioner James, and carried on a 7-0 vote the Planning Commission continue the Mitigated Negative Declaration, the Hearing on Commission Review and Approval No. 838 and the Public Hearing for the Socio-Economic Cost/Benefit Study and Conditional Use Permit No. 893 to February 26, 2008.

IV. NEW BUSINESS

A. **INVESTWEST PARTNERS IV, LP, APPLICANT** (PROJECT PLANNER: MANUEL BAEZA)

1. Planning Commission to consider a recommendation to the City Council on a Mitigated Negative Declaration.
2. **PUBLIC HEARING** for the Planning Commission to consider a recommendation to the City Council on a Socio-Economic Cost/Benefit Study.
3. **PUBLIC HEARING** for Planning Commission to consider a recommendation to the City Council on **STREET VACATION NO. 145** to vacate a segment of the existing alley east of Eureka Street from Pearl Avenue southerly a length of approximately 163 feet, in the Town Center District of Specific Plan No. 45.
4. **PUBLIC HEARING** for Planning Commission to consider a recommendation to the City Council on **STREET VACATION NO. 146** to vacate a segment of Ruiz Street from Pearl Avenue southerly a length of approximately 195 feet to High Avenue, in the Town Center District of Specific Plan No. 45.
5. Planning Commission to consider **COMMISSION REVIEW AND APPROVAL NO. 773 (REVISION NO. 1)** to expand an existing commercial center with the development of a two-story commercial building with an area of 18,200 square feet and new parking lot areas generally located on the south side of Pearl Avenue between Eureka Street and 3rd Street in the Town Center District of Specific Plan No. 45.

Chairman Macdonald opened the public hearing.

Project Planner Manuel Baeza gave a PowerPoint presentation and overview of the proposed project. Staff recommended that the Planning Commission recommend approval of the Mitigated Negative Declaration, Socio-Economic Cost Benefit Study and Street Vacation numbers 145 and 146 subject to the conditions of approval and continue Commission Review and Approval No. 773 R-1 to the meeting of March 25 2008.

Joe Donati, Investwest Group, spoke about landscaping difficulties, grading, the ADA ramps, the architecture of the buildings, the colors and awnings and the single drive aisle to the back which involves Dave's Paint. Mr. Donati had concerns relative to a late comment that was made by the Municipal Utilities Department relative to the sewers on Eureka and Pearl Street which would affect the entire frontage of the building. He stated that there also was an issue with a sewer line on Ruiz Street. Mr. Donati indicated that there were difficulties with the street trees which keep dying and would like to do further research on trees that could survive on site.

Commissioner Dyer suggested that the applicant's landscape architect look at shallow root tree types that would survive the tough conditions and commented that the existing planters looked dry and recommended using mulch to retain the moisture.

Mr. Donati indicated that there are plans to make a plaza area between buildings one and two which will have trees, a fountain and other amenities. He stated that he hopes to put in a restaurant that will bring activity to the patio area.

Commissioner Dyer suggested that triangular planters could be put on the south elevation of the building every couple of feet without having an effect on the site design. Mr. Donati stated that he would work with staff on Commissioner Dyer's suggestion.

Commissioner Miller stated that he would like to see a solution to the grading since it could have an effect on the architecture. Mr. Donati stated that the Commission will see a revised grading plan in the March 25th Planning Commission packet.

Commissioner Miller complimented the general color scheme but indicated that the awnings on the existing building appear small and suggested having the awnings come out in the horizontal dimension which would give them more substance. Commissioner Miller asked if something could be done to enable the applicant to place the pots six inches into the public right-a-way. Mr. Baeza stated that he would look into it.

Commissioner Miller had concerns relative to the detail of the architecture. Commissioner Miller commented that looking at the north elevation, starting at the east end, there is the door that serves the elevator lobby which may go away and then the balance of that is relatively plain and that the whole scheme is rather symmetrical except on the two outside elements. He was hoping to fill something in there that might give it some symmetry like the rest of the façade. He indicated that more detail was needed on the cornice and that the darker shade shown on the rendering be used other than what is indicated on the color board. He suggested putting a control joint centered on the two remaining arched windows and asked that plans be brought back showing details on the window box theme that sits on the ledge of each of the windows on the second floor.

Commissioner Miller stated that the planter boxes need more detailing and suggested supporting them by a corbel if they come out very far. Commissioner Miller indicated that the east side is the more visible public view and needs more attention.

Commissioner James indicated that he likes the color of the awnings that are shown on the rendering more than the shade shown on the color board.

David Crane, owner of Dave's Paint, stated that he did not want to see the alley closed at this time and indicated that there was an agreement with the City in 1998 that the alley would not be closed. Mr. Crane stated that he has fifty foot trucks that come through for deliveries and did not know if they could make

that turn coming in from the back into his driveway. He would like to see plans that will ensure that the trucks can make the turns.

Commissioner Dyer asked if showing an adequate turning radius on the plans would be acceptable to Mr. Crane. Mr. Crane indicated that it would be a consideration.

Mr. Dalquest stated that the Commission can continue the project so that staff can work with the applicant to get an exhibit relative to the trucks being able to get to the back and can also look into the agreement with the City of Redlands that was made back in 1998.

Commissioner Miller suggested that an easement could be granted to Dave's Paint that runs with the property until such time the use changes to something less industrial and more retail. Mr. Dalquest stated that the applicant can provide an easement that ensures perpetuity that Mr. Crane would have access through the single lane driveway.

Teresa Valdez-Rubio and Gloria Poloski, Ruiz Street residents, indicated that they would not be able to obtain access to the back portion or sides of their homes. They indicated that the only way they can access their property is on the vacated area that is being closed. Chairman Macdonald suggested that they get together with staff to work out details.

Mr. Donati indicated that the turning movement is from Pearl Street to what is Ruiz Street and then Ruiz Street onto the single driveway and that the exit is straight out onto Eureka Street with a right only turn.

Commissioner Dyer asked Mr. Crane if there was a problem with his trucks making the right hand turn onto Eureka Street. Mr. Crane did not know if the trucks could come down the narrow driveway and make the turn onto Eureka Street.

Chairman Macdonald asked the Commission if this should be continued for more information on the street vacation. Commissioner Miller stated that it would be appropriate to have a condition of approval granting an easement since the applicant's property would prohibit Mr. Crane's trucks from crossing his property if they vacate the alley.

Chairman Macdonald asked if two weeks was sufficient time to research this issue. Mr. Dalquest indicated two weeks would be sufficient time.

Commissioner Miller commented on the windows that are on the Orange and State Street buildings indicating that they were set back within a deeper opening. He stated that it was essential for the applicant's building to look substantial and traditional and wanted to ensure that the applicant did not use a nail on frame technique where the windows were right on the surface of the wall. Mr. Donati stated that he would take a two by six wall where it gives you a recess and that the window is setback.

Commissioner Dyer commented that the triangular planters would give the applicant an opportunity to have the ground location for a vine to grow up to the trellises on the south side. Mr. Donati stated that he liked Commissioner Dyer's idea and will explore further with the civil engineer.

Chairman Macdonald closed the public hearing.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Cook, seconded by Commissioner Foster, and carried on a 7-0 vote to continue the Mitigated Negative Declaration, the Socio-Economic Cost/Benefit Study, Street Vacation No. 145, Street Vacation No. 146 and Commission Review and Approval No. 773 (Revision No. 1) to the February 26, 2008 meeting.

Chairman Macdonald recessed the meeting at 3:45 p.m.

Chairman Macdonald reconvened the meeting at 3:50 p.m.

B. REDLANDS COMMUNITY HOSPITAL, APPLICANT
(PROJECT PLANNER: CHRIS BOATMAN)

1. Planning Commission to consider a Mitigated Negative Declaration.
2. **PUBIC HEARING** for the Planning Commission to consider **CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT NO. 355 (REVISION 11)** - A Conditional Use Permit to construct a 56,333 square foot parking lot within the Redlands Community Hospital site located at 350Terracina Boulevard in the M-F, Medical Facility District.

Chairman Macdonald opened the public hearing.

Project Planner Chris Boatman gave a PowerPoint presentation and overview of the proposed project. Mr. Boatman indicated that the current landscape plans show citrus trees along Terracina Boulevard but was advised by the applicant today that he intends to continue the Magnolia trees along the frontage of Terracina Boulevard. Staff recommended approval of the project subject to the conditions of approval.

Pat Meyer, Urban Environs, indicated that the citrus trees along Terracina Boulevard would afford too much screening to the parking lot. Mr. Meyer concurred with the conditions of approval.

Commissioner Dyer indicated that the spacing between the current trees are far apart and asked if the new trees would have the same spacing. Mr. Meyer stated that they would match whatever the code requires relative to the spacing of the trees.

Commissioner Dyer stated that she would like to see the existing trees fully indicated on the plans. Mr. Meyer indicated that he would ensure that the final landscape plans would show all the existing trees that will remain.

Chairman Macdonald asked if there needed to be a condition of approval added to retain the existing trees that are identified on the plans. Assistant Director Bob Dalquest indicated that a condition of approval could be added.

Mr. Meyer indicated that some of the Eucalyptus trees were dead and that an arborist would visit the site to determine which trees would need to be removed for safety purposes. Mr. Meyer indicated that those trees that have survived and were still thriving would be kept.

Janet Cosgrove, owner of the Morey Mansion, commented that Redlands Community Hospital have been good neighbors and was fine with everything that they have been doing.

Chairman Macdonald closed the public hearing.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Miller, seconded by Commissioner James, and carried on a 7-0 vote that the Planning Commission approve the Mitigated Negative Declaration for Conditional Use Permit No. 355 (Revision 11) and direct staff to file and post a "Notice of Determination" in accordance with City guidelines.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Miller, seconded by Commissioner James, and carried on a 7-0 vote that the Planning Commission approve Conditional Use Permit No. 355 (Revision 11) based on the following findings:

1. That the proposed development will not adversely affect the applicable land use plans of the City; the project is consistent with existing development found at the Redland Community Hospital;
2. That the proposed development will not be detrimental to the public health, safety and welfare; the project includes Mitigation Measures designed to address concerns of public health and safety;
3. That the proposed development will comply to the maximum extent feasible with the regulations of the City's General Plan, and the MF, Medical Facility District;
4. That the proposed parking lot is appropriate at the Redland Community Hospital.

This includes the elimination of condition of approval number thirty (30) and the addition of condition of approval number thirty-one (31) as follows:

31. The applicant shall replace the proposed citrus trees along Terracina Boulevard with the same species of tree currently present within the parkway in the hospitals frontage, and preserve existing tree's along the northwesterly property line adjacent to the Morey Mansion and shall be shown on the landscape plans.

C. WHISPER RANCH, LTD, APPLICANT
(PROJECT PLANNER: TABITHA KEVARI)

1. **PUBLIC HEARING** for the Planning Commission to consider **VARIANCE NO. 750** from Section 18.32.070 of the Redlands Municipal Code to increase the maximum coverage by structures from 20% to 23% to allow the construction of a new single family dwelling, and an accessory patio on a vacant lot located at 1675 Fountain Circle in the R-A, Residential Estate District.

Chairman Macdonald opened the public hearing.

Project Planner Tabitha Kevari gave an overview of the proposed variance. Staff recommended approval of Variance No. 750 subject to the conditions of approval.

Chairman Macdonald closed the public hearing.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Foster, seconded by Commissioner James, and carried on a 7-0 vote that the Planning Commission approve Variance No. 750 subject to the following findings and attached conditions of approval:

1. There are exceptional or extraordinary circumstances or conditions applicable to the property or the intended use that do not apply generally to other properties or uses in the same vicinity and zone; the preservation of open space and mature trees within the development creates an exceptional condition that affects the property;
2. That the variance is necessary for the preservation and enjoyment of a substantial property right possessed by other properties in the same vicinity and zone district, but which is denied to the property in question; there are properties in the vicinity and zone that have coverage that exceeds the twenty percent.
3. That the granting of the variance will not be detrimental to the public welfare or injurious to the property or improvements of others in the vicinity; the project is in a gated

community and the site will have a large rear yard setback minimizing impacts to other properties.

4. That the granting of the variance will not adversely affect the General Plan of the City of Redlands; the General Plan Land Use Designation of Very Low Density Residential will not be affected by the project.

D. **EUGENE JARAMILLO, APPLICANT**
(PROJECT PLANNER: TABITHA KEVARI)

1. PUBLIC HEARING for the Planning Commission to consider **CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT NO. 923** to establish a riding stable and academy and the relocation of a mobile home unit for the academy's office use located at 28442 San Timoteo Canyon Road in the A-1, Agricultural District.

Chairman Macdonald opened the public hearing.

Project Planner Tabitha Kevari indicated that she received a continuance request from the applicant and recommended continuance of Conditional Use Permit No. 923 to the February 26, 2008 meeting.

Chairman Macdonald closed the public hearing.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner James, seconded by Commissioner Foster, and carried on a 7-0 vote to continue Conditional Use Permit No. 923 to the meeting of February 26, 2008.

V. ADDENDA - NONE

VI. MINUTES

A. JANUARY 22, 2008

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner James, seconded by Commissioner Miller, and carried on a 7-0 vote to approve the minutes of January 22, 2008 with one correction.

VII. LAND USE AND CITY COUNCIL ACTIONS OF FEBRUARY 5, 2008

Assistant Director Dalquest gave a brief presentation on the City Council Actions of February 5, 2008.

VIII. ADJOURN TO FEBRUARY 26, 2008

Chairman Macdonald adjourned the meeting at 4:14 p.m. to February 26, 2008.

Christine Szilva
Senior Administrative Assistant

Robert Dalquest, Assistant Director
Community Development Department

