

MINUTES: of the Planning Commission Meeting of the City of Redlands held Tuesday, March 13, 2012, at 4:00 p.m. are as follows:

PRESENT: Gary Miller, Chairman
John James, Vice Chairman
Carol Dyer, Commissioner
Conrad Guzkowski, Commissioner
Jan Hudson, Commissioner
Ken Jeske, Commissioner
Julie Rock, Commissioner

ADVISORY STAFF Oscar Orci, Development Services Director
PRESENT: Robert Dalquest, Assistant Development Services Director
Manuel Baeza, Principal Planner
Tabitha Kevari, Associate Planner
Chris Boatman, Associate Planner

I. CALL TO ORDER AND PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD - 3 MINUTES

Chairman Miller called the meeting to order, and opened up the Public Comment period. All members were present.

II. CONSENT CALENDAR - None

III. OLD BUSINESS

A. **SHANTI DEWAN, APPLICANT**
(PROJECT PLANNER: MANUEL BAEZA)

1. Consideration of a Notice of Exemption pursuant to Section 15311(a) of the California Environmental Quality Act Guidelines.
2. Consideration of **Commission Sign Review No. 386** to construct a twenty-four (24) square foot monument sign with an overall height of four feet for the Redlands Auto Spa located at 2051 W. Redlands Boulevard in the EV/CG (General Commercial) District of the East Valley Corridor Specific Plan.

Assistant Director Robert Dalquest stated that staff has not received the revised plans and requested a continuance to April 10, 2012.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Dyer, seconded by Vice Chairman James and carried on a 7-0 vote that the Planning Commission continue Commission Sign Review No. 386 to April 10, 2012.

IV. NEW BUSINESS

A. **HOWARD INDUSTRIAL PARTNERS, LLC, APPLICANT**
(PROJECT PLANNER; TABITHA KEVARI)

1. Consideration of a recommendation to the City Council on a Mitigated Negative Declaration.

2. **PUBLIC HEARING** to consider a recommendation to the City Council on a Socio-Economic Cost/Benefit Study.
3. **PUBLIC HEARING** to consider a recommendation to the City Council on **General Plan Amendment No. 128** to amend the General Plan Land Use Designation from Agricultural/City Grove to Commercial/Industrial for four (4) contiguous parcels totaling 37.4 acres located north of Palmetto Avenue, east of Nevada Street and west of California Street; and, to amend Figure 5.1 (Trafficway Network) of the Circulation Element to change the designation of Palmetto Avenue, from California Street to Nevada Street, from a Major Arterial to a Collector.
4. **PUBLIC HEARING** to consider a recommendation to the City Council on **Specific Plan No. 40 (Amendment No. 41)** to change the land use designation from EV/OS (Open Space) District to EV/IR (Regional Industrial) District of the East Valley Corridor Specific Plan for four (4) contiguous parcels totaling 37.4 acres located north of Palmetto Avenue, east of Nevada Street and west of California Street; and, to amend Figure 4-1 (Circulation Plan) of the East Valley Corridor Specific Plan to change the designation of Palmetto Avenue, from California Street to Nevada Street, from a Major Highway to a Collector.
5. Planning Commission determination as to General Plan conformity on **Street Vacation No. 156** to vacate eight (8) feet in width and approximately 2,472 feet in length along the north side of Palmetto Avenue in the EV/OS (Open Space) District of the East Valley Corridor Specific Plan (Proposed change from a Major Arterial to a Collector).
6. Planning Commission to consider **Commission Review and Approval No. 873** to develop a 809,338 square foot warehouse distribution center on 37.4 acres located on the north side of Palmetto Avenue, the west side of Nevada Street and the east side of California Street within the EV/OS (Open Space) District of the East Valley Corridor Specific Plan (Proposed change to EV/IR [Regional Industrial] District of the East Valley Corridor Specific Plan).

Associate Planner Tabitha Kevari gave a PowerPoint presentation and overview of the proposed project. Staff recommended approvals on the Mitigated Negative Declaration, General Plan No. 128, Amendment No. 41 to Specific Plan No. 40, and Street Vacation No. 156 subject to the conditions of approval and to continue the Commission Review and Approval No. 873 and Socio-Economic Cost Benefit Study to the May 8, 2012 Planning Commission.

Commissioner Dyer requested clarification on the street improvements on California Street and Nevada Street. Associate Planner Kevari stated the specific plan does not require any additional widening per the special landscaped areas.

Assistant Director Dalquest stated California Street is a major arterial at Palmetto Avenue, and then it becomes a local street north of Palmetto Avenue.

Commissioner Dyer expressed concern regarding the removal of twenty-one (21) palm trees for the driveways and site lines, and requested clarification on the conditions of approval.

Mr. Don Young, Municipal Utilities, stated the existing right-of-way is thirty (30) feet and the dedication proposed was thirty-three (33) feet. The layout of California Street was to preserve the row of palm trees. Mr. Young confirmed the removal of the palm trees was due to the applicant's onsite design.

Commissioner Guzkowski inquired if the cul-de-sac turnaround on California Street was adequate. Mr. Young confirmed.

Commissioner Rock requested an additional condition to transplant the palms that are removed from the site.

Associate Planner Kevari confirmed.

Chairman Miller opened up the Public Hearing.

Mr. Tim Howard, owner, confirmed they will preserve the palm trees.

Commissioner Miller stated the detention basin indicated hydro seed in the embankment and inquired if the applicant proposed irrigation and if the applicant had considered another material other than cobblestones. Mr. Howard confirmed the embankments are irrigated and stated the cobblestones are a part of the filtration system.

Commissioner Miller inquired if the new codes for California allowed the use of grass for the filtration of the basin. Mr. Tom Hayes, Landscape Architect, deferred the question to the civil engineer.

Director Orci stated the Drought Tolerant Landscape Ordinance discourages sod wherever possible, and confirmed that staff agreed with the engineers that the basin would not be visible. Director Orci confirmed if sod is desired to consider it as an accent where it could be seen.

Mr. Roger Priend, Albert A. Webb and Associates, confirmed the Regional Water Board does not allow grass in the basins any longer.

Mr. Howard stated they will maintain the basins; the top layer is scraped off, and the silts would be removed then new rock would be laid out as part of the Water Quality Management Plan (WQMP).

Commissioner Dyer requested clarification on the landscaping details for the front of the building. Commissioner Dyer recommended an added condition of approval that the applicant will submit a more enlarged detail on the shrub planting landscape plan to ensure adequate screening. Mr. Hayes concurred.

Mr. Albert Kelly, resident, inquired what the selling price was on the land. Mr. Kelly requested clarification if the funds for the orange groves were a part of Measure O, and if the forty (40) acres of Open Space would be recompensed back to Measure O. Mr. Kelly recommended a more native tree pallet that would require less water. Mr. Kelly stated a more organic approach to the basin is Cat-o'-nine tails.

Mr. Orci stated the City Council did approve the CPDA which provides the framework for the disposition of the property. The sale of the property requires the applicant to obtain entitlements and to go through the plan check process before the escrow can open on the sale of the property. The sale was just under Twelve (12) million dollars and the City Council will establish a committee on how to spend the proceeds.

Mr. Friend stated since 2009 they are required to reduce the amount of water used by fifty percent. They try to use native plants but because of the size of the development many nurseries do not have a large quantity in inventory to meet their needs, so they use other types of drought tolerant plants.

Mr. Hayes stated there are maintenance issues with installing vegetation in the bottom of a detention basin, and the major pollutant concern is the hydrocarbons. The design of the basin as proposed will remove the pollutants of concern.

Chairman Miller stated Mr. Kelly recommended the Cat-o'-nine-tails plant to specifically target the hydrocarbons. Mr. Hayes stated there is no vegetation that would directly remove hydrocarbons.

Mr. Steve Rogers, Church Street, stated the proposed project does not fit in the category of a mitigated negative declaration. Mr. Rogers stated the project is a significant land use change and is vacating a street and recommended an Environmental Impact Report (EIR) for the project. Mr. Rogers said the streets will be used by trucks, and a traffic study should be completed to justify the reduction of the street width. Mr. Rogers confirmed the project is in the EVCSP District which is a county specific plan. Mr. Rogers petitioned the City Council to update the General Plan.

Assistant Director Dalquest stated the East Valley Corridor Specific Plan was approved in 1989 and was a multi jurisdictional specific plan that involved the City of Redlands, San Bernardino, and Loma Linda. The portion of the specific plan that is in Redlands is the City's specific plan. Assistant Director Dalquest stated staff had required several technical studies and there were no items that could not be mitigated to a less than significant level, and a Mitigated Negative Declaration was prepared.

Commissioner Guzkowski inquired if the street vacation will impact any future development in the area. Assistant Director Dalquest stated it would not impact any future development.

Commissioner Jeske inquired how the City will enforce the condition of approval requiring truck traffic to use California Street. Assistant Director Dalquest stated it is a standard condition that is applied to warehouse distribution centers.

Ms. Amanda Frye, resident, stated she submitted a letter to the Environmental Review Committee requesting an EIR to be prepared for this project to address the impacts to the air quality from agricultural land to a heavy diesel traffic use. Ms. Frye expressed concern on the removal of the orange groves. Ms. Frye inquired why the City is giving the developer land for free relative to the street vacation.

Assistant Director Dalquest stated the Initial Study recommended the air quality and green house gas study completed and it indicated the impacts were less than significant. Assistant Director Dalquest confirmed the dedication of the street vacation goes back to the property.

Chairman Miller closed the Public Hearing.

Commissioner Dyer stated she had concerns on the conversion of the orange groves and had requested additional information on the development agreement that had gone to City Council from Ms. Kevari. The development agreement provided more of an opportunity to purchase other lands in the City that were in a more useable location for orange groves. Commissioner Dyer confirmed she was assuaged with the information found in the development agreement.

Vice Chairman James stated the proposed land was intended as a buffer for the landfill and waste water treatment plant. The buffer land is very valuable and if the buffer zone is eliminated the land use would have to be mitigated. Vice Chairman James expressed concern that a future land owner may not be satisfied being close to a landfill and waste water treatment plant. Vice Chairman James stated he was in opposition on the general plan amendment and specific plan amendment and was in support to leave the land as open space.

Commissioner Guzkowski stated originally he had concerns on water conservation, traffic, pollution, and the proximity of the landfill and water treatment plant. Commissioner Guzkowski confirmed staff had mitigated the issues adequately and stated he was in support of the proposed project. Commissioner Guzkowski acknowledged Mr. Link's letter and confirmed the proposed use would be compatible with the use on the south side of Palmetto Avenue.

Commissioner Rock expressed concern on the conversion of the open space, and recommended additional findings to justify the open space conversion. Commissioner Rock stated she had concerns with traffic, the street width, and requested the relocation of the palm trees. Commissioner Rock stated the proposed project is a good buffer and she was generally in support of the project.

Commissioner Jeske stated the site is not the best place for open space, and the proposed project is a good fit for the location. Commissioner Jeske stated the best place to have open space is where it is visible, part of the Emerald Necklace, and at a location where the public could enjoy. Commissioner Jeske recommended a general plan amendment to allow the best buffer for the area.

Chairman Miller confirmed the desire of the Commission as follows:

- Recommended strengthening the findings and intent relative to open space as well as determine alternative sites for open space.
- An added condition regarding the relocation of the palm trees.
- An added condition for future owners to acknowledge the landfill and waste water treatment plant, as a neighbor.

The Commission concurred.

Chairman Miller re-opened the Public Hearing.

Mr. Howard stated it is the City Council's responsibility to identify appropriate locations for open space. Mr. Howard stated the proposed facility will have a compressed natural gas filling station on site, and is the only one of its kind in California.

Chairman Miller closed the Public Hearing, and requested clarification on the findings.

Commission Rock stated findings provide details and justifies the reason for an action from the Planning Commission. It helps to clarify consistency with state law and the City's existing documents.

Commissioner Jeske stated there was an added condition for a more detailed landscaping plan. Commissioner Dyer recommended thorough details with shrubbery and ground cover on the southerly elevation of Palmetto.

Chairman Miller requested an added condition to incorporate a creative cobblestone design within the detention basin.

Associate Planner Kevari reviewed the added conditions as follows:

61. The applicant was amicable to relocate the existing *Washingtonia robusta* palms on site that are proposed for removal.
62. The applicant shall submit an additional landscape plan that illustrates detailed plantings of shrubs and ground cover along Palmetto Avenue frontage.
63. The applicant shall incorporate a cobblestone design within the detention basin located at the southwest corner of the project site.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Dyer, seconded by Commissioner Hudson and carried on a 7-0 vote that the Planning Commission recommend approval to the City Council of the Mitigated Negative Declaration for General Plan No. 128, Amendment No. 41 to Specific Plan No. 40, Street Vacation No. 156 and Commission Review and Approval No. 873.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Dyer, seconded by Commissioner Hudson and carried on a 7-0 vote that the Planning Commission continue the Socio-Economic Cost Benefit Study for Commission Review and Approval No. 873 to the meeting of May 8, 2012.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Dyer, seconded by Commissioner Hudson and carried on a 6-1 vote (Vice Chairman James opposed) that the Planning Commission approve Resolution No. 1224 and recommend that the City Council adopt General Plan Amendment No. 128.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Dyer, seconded by Commissioner Hudson and carried on a 6-1 vote (Vice Chairman James opposed) that the Planning Commission approve Resolution No. 1225 and recommend that the City Council adopt Amendment No. 41 to Specific Plan No. 40.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Dyer, seconded by Commissioner Hudson and carried on a 7-0 vote that the Planning Commission approve Resolution No. 1226 and recommend that the City Council adopt Street Vacation No. 156.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Dyer, seconded by Commissioner Hudson and carried on a 7-0 vote that the Planning Commission continue Commission Review and Approval No. 873 to the meeting of May 8, 2012.

Director Orci stated the findings relative to the general plan and zoning code are quasi legislative actions, and staff will provide a rationale under the Commission Review and Approval which will be a part of the next staff report.

B. **ESRI, APPLICANT**

(PROJECT PLANNER: CHRIS BOATMAN)

1. Consideration of a recommendation to the City Council on a Mitigated Negative Declaration.
2. **PUBLIC HEARING** to consider a recommendation to the City Council on **General Plan Amendment No. 129** to amend the General Plan Land Use Designation from High Density Residential to Office for a 1.15 acre parcel located on the north side of State Street, between Texas Street and New York Street.
3. **PUBLIC HEARING** to consider a recommendation to the City Council on **Zone Change No. 440** to change the zoning designation from R-2 (Multiple-Family Residential) District to A-P (Administrative and Professional Office) District for a 1.15 acre parcel located on the north side of State Street, between Texas Street and New York Street.
4. Consideration of **Commission Review and Approval No. 825 (Revision No. 8)** to construct a parking lot for the ESRI campus containing 99 spaces on a 1.15 acre parcel located on the north side of State Street, between Texas Street and New York Street, in the R-2 (Multiple Family Residential) District (Proposed change to the A-P [Administrative and Professional Office] District).

Associate Planner Chris Boatman gave a PowerPoint presentation and overview of the proposed project. Staff recommended approval to the City Council of General Plan Amendment No. 129, Zone Change No. 440 and to continue Commission Review and Approval No. 825 (Revision No. 8) to the meeting of April 24, 2012.

Director Orci stated staff is concerned with an increase to the landscaping along the street; it may cause a safety issue with the natural depression.

Commissioner Dyer recommended the applicant provide screening so the cars are not seen from the street, and thanked the applicant for the preservation of the existing trees.

Commissioner Jeske expressed concern on the lack of turnaround space on parking space number 81 and 82. Commissioner Jeske inquired if the applicant was going to include the remnant C-4 zoning in the proposal. Assistant Director Dalquest confirmed the applicant had chosen not to include the remnants in the proposal because the use is consistent with the current zoning designation.

Chairman Miller opened up the Public Hearing.

Mr. Dave Atchley, representative, stated he was available for any questions.

Commissioner Dyer inquired if ESRI would be interested in purchasing the Nevada Street Post Office site, which ESRI surrounds, so the historic Redlands Post Office site downtown could remain open. Mr. Atchley stated ESRI has looked into the sale of the Post Office and has had some discussion with them.

Commissioner Hudson inquired if ESRI is considering installing electrical vehicle charging stations to their parking facility. Mr. Atchley stated they are considering charging stations for a future building proposal on the westside of the campus.

Chairman Miller requested clarification on the raised curb. Mr. Atchley clarified. Associate Planner Boatman stated staff had spoke with the engineer regarding the drainage and they are plan checking the Water Quality Management Plan (WQMP) and how drainage will interface with the adjacent lot to the north.

Ms. Amanda Frye, resident, requested clarification on the location of the parking lot and confirmed she could not find the site and expressed concern that the noticing was not valid. Commissioner Dyer clarified the location.

Chairman Miller closed the Public Hearing.

Commissioner Dyer requested an additional condition to add shrub screening or screening on the parking facing the street using similar materials found on the most recent approval. Associate Planner Boatman stated he will add a condition.

MOTION

It was moved by Vice Chairman James, seconded by Commissioner Jeske and carried on a 6-0 vote (Commissioner Guzkowski recused) that the Planning Commission recommend approval to the City Council of the Mitigated Negative Declaration for General Plan Amendment No. 129, Zone Change No. 440 and Commission Review and Approval No. 825 (Revision No. 8).

MOTION

It was moved by Vice Chairman James, seconded by Commissioner Jeske and carried on a 6-0 vote (Commissioner Guzkowski recused) that the Planning Commission approve Resolution No. 1222 recommending approval to the City Council of General Plan Amendment No. 129 to amend the General Plan Land Use Designation from High Density Residential to Office.

MOTION

It was moved by Vice Chairman James, seconded by Commissioner Jeske and carried on a 6-0 vote (Commissioner Guzkowski recused) that the Planning Commission approve Resolution No. 1223 recommending approval to the City Council of Zone Change No. 440 to change the zoning designation from R-2 (Multiple Family Residential) District to A-P (Administrative and Professional Office) District.

MOTION

It was moved by Vice Chairman James, seconded by Commissioner Jeske and carried on a 6-0 vote (Commissioner Guzkowski recused) that the Planning Commission continue Commission Review and Approval No. 825 (Revision 8) to the meeting of April 24, 2012.

This will include the addition of Condition of Approval No. 42 as follows:

42. The applicant shall continue the landscape treatment present along the frontage of the adjoining parking area located to the east of the project site within those portions of the project that are visible from the right-of-way for the purpose of providing additional screening.

C. **WOODY, LLC AND J.A.W LAND & TRADING, LLC, APPLICANT**
(PROJECT PLANNER: CHRIS BOATMAN)

1. Consideration of a Notice of Exemption pursuant to Section 15061(b)(3) of the California Environmental Quality Act Guidelines.
2. **PUBLIC HEARING** to consider a request by the property owner on a determination of status regarding three contiguous parcels totaling 43.02 acres that have been determined by the City to be merged; in accordance with Section 17.21 of the Redlands Municipal Code and Section 66451.11 of the State Subdivision Map Act, located between Sunset Drive North and the Interstate 10 Freeway, east of Wabash Avenue in the A-1 (Agricultural) District; more commonly known as Crystal Springs Ranch.

Associate Planner Boatman gave a PowerPoint presentation and overview of the proposed project. Assistant Planner Boatman recommended the Planning Commission concur with staff that the merger meets the criteria.

Commissioner Jeske requested clarification on the excess right-of-way and Wabash Avenue. Associate Planner Boatman stated the property owner is no longer interested in utilizing a portion of Wabash Avenue.

Chairman Miller opened up the Public Hearing.

Mr. Pat Meyer, representative, stated the property owner is in support of staff's recommendation on the lot merger.

Mr. Kelly, resident, stated he was in agreement with the lot merger. Mr. Kelly recommended the City conduct negotiations with Mr. Meyer on the proposed property as well as the Mistretta property for open space.

Ms. Frye, resident, inquired if Lot A and Lot B are going to be merged with Parcel C. Associate Planner Boatman confirmed.

Chairman Miller closed the Public Hearing.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Dyer, seconded by Commissioner Rock and carried on a 7-0 vote that the Planning Commission find that the merger of Parcels A and B as referenced in the staff report, is exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act Guidelines pursuant to Section 15061(b)(3).

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Dyer, seconded by Commissioner Rock and carried on a 7-0 vote that the Planning Commission find that Parcels A and B as referenced in the staff report, meet the criteria for merger pursuant to Section 17.21 of the Redlands Municipal Code and direct staff to file a Notice Of Merger for record with the County Recorder.

V. ADDENDA-None

VI. MINUTES

B. Planning Commission Minutes of January 10, 2012.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Hudson, seconded by Vice Chairman James and carried on a 7-0 vote that the Planning Commission approve the minutes of January 10, 2012.

VII. LAND USE AND CITY COUNCIL ACTIONS OF FEBRUARY 21st AND MARCH 6, 2012.

Chairman Miller inquired if there were City Council actions to report.

Director Orci stated the City Council approved the time extension for Westside Christian Church for one year.

VIII. ADJOURN TO MARCH 14, 2012

Chairman Miller adjourned the meeting at 5:35 p.m. to the March 14, 2012 Special Planning Commission meeting at 7:00 pm in the Joslyn Senior Center; 21 Grant Street.

Linda McCasland
Senior Administrative Technician

Oscar Orci
Development Services Director