

MINUTES: of the Planning Commission Meeting of the City of Redlands held Wednesday, March 14, 2012, at 7:00 p.m. are as follows:

PRESENT: Gary Miller, Chairman
John James, Vice Chairman
Carol Dyer, Commissioner
Conrad Guzkowski, Commissioner
Jan Hudson, Commissioner
Ken Jeske, Commissioner
Julie Rock, Commissioner

ADVISORY STAFF Oscar Orci, Development Services Director
PRESENT: Robert Dalquest, Assistant Development Services Director

A. CALL SPECIAL MEETING TO ORDER

Chairman Miller called the meeting to order. All members were present.

B. PUBLIC COMMENTS

(At this time, the Planning Commission will provide an opportunity for the public to address them on any subject, within the jurisdiction of the City of Redlands, which is not already scheduled on this agenda. However, any matter that requires action will be referred to staff for a report and action at a subsequent meeting. Please limit your comments to three (3) minutes.)

Chairman Miller opened the Public Comment period. There were no comments forthcoming and the Public Comment period was closed.

C. WALMART STORES, INC., APPLICANT

1. Consideration of a recommendation to the City Council on an Environmental Impact Report.
2. **PUBLIC HEARING** to consider a recommendation to the City Council on a Socio-Economic Cost/Benefit Study.
3. **PUBLIC HEARING** to consider a recommendation to the City Council on **Conditional Use Permit No. 945** for a development plan to construct a 256,614 square foot retail and commercial center on approximately 32.97 acres containing a 196,114 square foot Walmart store, nine (9) out-parcels with a potential of 60,500 square feet consisting of three (3) parcels for fast food restaurants with drive-through facilities, three (3) retail parcels, one parcel for retail and fast food restaurants without drive-through facilities, one parcel for retail with a drive-through facility and one sit-down restaurant parcel, and a 0.56 acre detention basin located on the southeast corner of San Bernardino Avenue and Tennessee Street in Concept Plan No. 4 of the East Valley Corridor Specific Plan.
4. **PUBLIC HEARING** to consider a recommendation to the City Council on **Minor Subdivision No. 330** (Tentative Parcel Map No. 19060) to subdivide 45 acres into eleven (11) parcels and one lettered lot for a proposed 256,614 square foot retail and commercial center located on the southeast corner of San Bernardino Avenue and Tennessee Street in Concept Plan No. 4 of the East Valley Corridor Specific Plan.

Assistant Director Robert Dalquest gave a brief presentation describing the proposed project. Assistant Director Dalquest introduced Mr. Bob Prasse and Mr. Charles Holcomb from Michael Brandman Associates. Mr. Prasse gave a brief presentation on the Environmental Impact Report for proposed project.

D. PUBLIC COMMENTS

(At this time, the Planning Commission will provide an opportunity for the public to address them on the subject, which is scheduled on this special meeting agenda. Please limit your comments to three (3) minutes.)

Chairman Miller called Mr. David Stone to address the Commission.

Mr. Stone stated the Walmart Super Center will bring in revenue and sales tax for the City and was in favour of the proposed project.

Chairman Miller called Ms. Amanda Frye to address the Commission.

Ms. Frye confirmed her opposition to the proposed project and expressed concern on the following:

- Loss of farmland in the City
- Loss of orange groves
- Farmland shelters wildlife, provides scenic open space and filters impurities in the air
- There are creative options for the current Walmart if more space is needed

Chairman Miller called Ms. Ande Spencer to address the Commission.

Ms. Spencer declined to speak.

Chairman Miller called Ms. Sunny Wallick to address the Commission.

Ms. Wallick stated she concurred with Ms. Frye's comments and expressed concern on the following:

- The disruption of the Burrowing Owls habitat
- Paving over valuable land
- Air Quality

Chairman Miller called Mr. Mario Saucedo to address the Commission.

Mr. Saucedo, North Side Visioning Committee Chairman, stated Redlands Crossing is a quality project and confirmed they are in support of the proposed project for the following reasons:

- The proposed project is zoned for the use and staff has mitigated any concerns.
- Redlands Crossing will increase revenue
- The store will provide jobs for citizens
- The proposed project will give the citizens convenience and savings

Chairman Miller called Ms. Sara Graham to address the Commission.

Ms. Graham confirmed her support of the Walmart Supercenter for the following reasons:

- The City is losing revenue and taxes from the supercenters in Beaumont, and Moreno Valley.
- Redlands needs more department stores like Victoria Gardens in the downtown area.

Chairman Miller called Ms. Jean Davis to address the Commission.

Ms. Davis confirmed her support of the proposed project for the following reasons:

- Redlands is losing \$500.00 when they shop at the supercenters in Beaumont, Moreno Valley and Hemet.
- Traffic won't pull off the freeway to shop small stores but will pull off to visit a supercenter.

Chairman Miller called Ms. Faith Clement to address the Commission.

Ms. Clement, Yucaipa resident, confirmed her support of the proposed project for the following reasons:

- She is considered extremely low income and is restricted to shop locally.
- The proposed Walmart is vital to her well being.

Chairman Miller called Mr. Roger Cejalvo to address the Commission.

Mr. Cejalvo stated Redlands citizens voted to have a Walmart Supercenter, and confirmed his support.

Chairman Miller called Ms. Mary Zapor to address the Commission.

Ms. Zapor confirmed her opposition to the proposed Walmart for the followings reasons:

- Traffic congestion
- Streets are in need of repair
- Vacant Walmart store
- Walmart Supercenter will and is affecting the homes values.
- Walmart does not fit the characteristics of Redlands.

Chairman Miller called Ms. Laura Palmer to address the Commission.

Ms. Palmer confirmed her opposition to the proposed project for the following reasons:

- The 2006 Northside Visioning Plan states future developments need to incorporate public green space or plazas in projects. Commercial development should not include big box warehouse stores; but should include high quality businesses with an eclectic village style with walking paths, seating areas and water features. There should be a moratorium on liquor stores, warehouses, auto repair, and businesses operating 24 hours a day unless it's a medical facility.
- The site is 40+ acres one fourth is considered farmland.
- Greater risk of cancer from the diesel emissions.

- The EIR clearly state the Air Quality can not be mitigated.
- There is a Super Walmart being constructed in Highland.

Ms. Palmer recommended the No Project Alternative.

Chairman Miller called Mr. Arthur Harp to address the Commission.

Mr. Harp confirmed his opposition to the proposed project for the following reasons:

- Consider using an abandoned facility for the Super Walmart like the Redlands Mall, or the Redlands Parkway.
- The City dumps water on Pennsylvania Avenue every few months to drain the tanks. The City needs to consider spending money more wisely, can't the water be reclaimed?
- The City needs to think it through and consider the consequences.

Chairman Miller called Mr. Stephen Kemp to address the Commission.

Mr. Kemp confirmed his opposition to the proposed project for the following reasons:

- Walmart has a horrible record on labor relations.
- Goods are manufactured in China
- Outsourcing
- Walmart hires undocumented workers for their warehouse.
- Walmart imposes an unsafe work environment, and have been fined often from Cal OSHA.

Mr. Kemp requested the community make a stand to keep Walmart out of the City.

Chairman Miller called Mr. Thomas Million to address the Commission.

Mr. Million stated he is in favor of the proposed project for the following reasons:

- Employment
- The proposed site is not being farmed.
- Increased tax revenue.

Chairman Miller called Dr. Tim Krantz to address the Commission.

Dr. Krantz recommended the following for the Commission's consideration:

- Urged the Commission to dedicate the 7.87 acres as open space on the east side of the project as a buffer for the residential.
- Consider building the new facility on the westside of the 330 Freeway across from Citrus Plaza.
- Recommended rooftop solar for the proposed project. It could generate an additional 6.7 million KW hours per year.

Chairman Miller called Mr. Michael Reilly to address the Commission.

Mr. Reilly gave an overview on the Walmart money multiplier effect which is a money marketing tool, for government spending and policies as follows:

- Retail stores seldom generate economic growth.
- Walmart is not efficient in their standards.
- The economy is affected when smaller retail stores are displaced.
- New Walmart stores reduce retail employment by 2.7% and each Walmart employee replaces 1.4 employees in the retail sector.
- Retail stores underestimate the employment rates by 400 to 500 %.
- Wages and benefits are lower for Walmart employees than other retail stores.

Mr. Reilly recommended staff reassess the economic effects with a multiplier that is specific to the Walmart Stores and that will more accurately depict the effects of the retained employment regionally.

Chairman Miller called Mr. John Nash to address the Commission.

Mr. Nash expressed concern that the City will offer a sales tax revenue rebate for Walmart.

Chairman Miller called Mr. Keith Osajima to address the Commission.

Mr. Osajima, Chairman of the Redlands Good Neighbor Coalition, confirmed his opposition to the proposed project and expressed concern of the following:

- Questioned the legitimacy on the timing for the public review periods.
- The documents are not available for the Public and the citizens are not given the time to review documents to make informed comments.

Chairman Miller called Mr. Steve Livacich to address the Commission.

Mr. Livacich confirmed his opposition to the proposed project and expressed his concerns as follows:

- Walmart makes the trucking company wait in a parking lot cargo area to avoid taxes on their warehouse.
- Walmart copies, produces, and patents items made in China.
- Have never met a Redlands citizen that works in the existing Walmart.
- Walmart supercenter does not fit with the characteristics of Redlands.

Chairman Miller called Mr. Brian Roche to address the Commission.

Mr. Roche confirmed his opposition to the proposed project and expressed his concerns as follows:

- Questionable merits are jobs, low prices, and tax revenue.
- In the past Walmart did not need to contribute sale tax because of the sweetheart deal and then had a massive advertising campaign against Measure "O" stating they were saving City services with new revenues.
- Supercenter sales tax revenues won't save the City services, because other stores will close due to the loss of revenues to Walmart.
- Destruction of the local business economy.
- Local businesses provide better jobs and keep money circulating locally.
- Once the competition is gone Walmart will raise their prices and quality will deteriorate.
- Walmart degrades the social and physical fabric of the community.
- By allowing Walmart it will violate smart growth planning.

- The poor need low prices and a thriving sustainable community which Walmart does not provide.

Chairman Miller called Mr. Phil Courtney to address the Commission.

Mr. Courtney confirmed his opposition to the proposed project and expressed his concerns as follows:

- Citrus Valley High School area is currently very congested with traffic and the proposed project will impact the area even more.
- Redlands needs streets that can handle the traffic, sidewalks and curbs that are repaired regularly.
- Redlands needs vibrant and local businesses that provide jobs with a liveable wage, health benefits, and hope for the future.

Chairman Miller called Ms. Nonie Kleinhans to address the Commission.

Ms. Kleinhans confirmed her opposition to the proposed project and expressed her concerns as follows:

- Concerned that Walmart will take resources that should go to the citizens.
- Crime goes up 400 % when a Super Walmart is near.
- Police services will increase.
- The proposed location is unsafe; it is open 24 hours, in a residential neighborhood near the high school, and they sell guns.

Chairman Miller called Ms. Christine Roque to address the Commission.

Ms. Roque confirmed she was opposed to the Special Planning Commission meeting for the following reasons:

- She could not prepare comments because the material was not provided for her review.

Chairman Miller called Mr. Paul LeMay to address the Commission.

Mr. LeMay confirmed his opposition to the proposed project and expressed his concerns on the following:

- His front door will face the project.
- Camping in the parking lot.
- Undesirable people in the area and concerned with the safety of his children.
- Crime, and graffiti
- Air pollution, light pollution, noise pollution

Chairman Miller called Ms. Michell Guajardo to address the Commission.

Ms. Guajardo, Redlands Walmart Store Manager, confirmed her support of the proposed project for the following reasons:

- Has worked for Walmart for 12 years and they take care of their employees.
- She has some employees that have been working for Walmart for over 20 years.

- The Associates received over \$200,000 in bonuses on the store profit this past year.

Chairman Miller called Ms. Deborah Adams to address the Commission.

Ms. Adams confirmed her support of the proposed project for the following reasons:

- Husband has been employed by Walmart for 20 years.

Chairman Miller stated there were no other Speaker Sign Up Sheets and encouraged the public to speak if they so desired.

Mr. Johnny Walker confirmed his opposition of the proposed project and expressed concern on the following reasons:

- Decrease in property values.
- Minimum wage is not enough to support yourself or family.
- City needs better businesses with a higher wage.

Mr. Shane McDuffey confirmed his opposition of the proposed project and expressed concern on the following reasons:

- Air Quality is significant and unavoidable.
- Concerned for the children in the neighborhood that will be affected with asthma.

Ms. Ann Memitt, Post Office employee, confirmed her opposition of the proposed project and expressed concern on the following:

- Traffic is horrendous in the area of the proposed project.
- Losing the Redlands that the citizens have come to love.
- Concerned with safety and crime.

Mr. Sam Davis confirmed his support of the proposed project for the following reasons:

- Walmart employees make a decent wage with benefits.
- Walmart contributes and supports the community.
- They do carry clothes that are made in the USA.

Ms. Amanda Parks stated she is considering settling down to a City that has entertainment, symphony, culture, clean air, theatre, and parks for the rest of her life. She confirmed her opposition to the proposed project for the following reasons:

- Concerned on safety
- Crime
- Air Pollution

Mr. Joe Gonzalez stated the north side does not receive any desirable businesses. Mr. Gonzalez confirmed his support of the proposed project for the following reasons:

- Will help the Redlands economy.
- Walmart is involved with the community, and makes generous donations.

Ms. Carol Bolden confirmed her opposition to the proposed project for the following reasons:

- Unmitigated air quality is unacceptable.
- Area has one of the highest particulate rates in the nation.
- Using wonderful land that could be used for agricultural.
- Safety and the sale of guns
- Why do we need another Walmart?
- Urban blight for the existing Walmart.

Mr. Steve Rogers confirmed his opposition to the proposed project for the following reasons:

- Noticing is premature
- Impact report consideration to the City Council that the public has not seen.
- There are no conditions of approval at this time.
- Development is not a right but is a privilege.
- Traffic and the effect of the 210 Freeway not taken into account.

Mr. Joe Castino confirmed his opposition to the proposed project for the following reasons:

- 22,000 daily vehicle trips will impact the project area.
- Traffic is a significant issue.
- Air Quality

Ms. Shelby Mann confirmed her opposition to the proposed project for the following reasons:

- Big box stores quickly degrade the community.
- Will lose many U of R alumni that would have remained in the City.
- Unmitigable pollutant levels
- Improve the community with local businesses and goods for the community.
- Loss of agriculture land

Chairman Miller closed the Public Comment Period.

E. ADJOURNMENT TO MARCH 27, 2012

Chairman Miller adjourned the meeting at 9:15 p.m. to the March 27, 2012 Planning Commission meeting.

Linda McCasland
Senior Administrative Technician

Oscar Orci
Development Services Director